



## **AmCham Security Committee**

### **Minutes**

**April 14, 2005**

#### **Attendees**

Anatoly Ilyin, Technical Security Systems  
(Co-Chair)  
Adam Blanco, Russian Microfinance  
Center  
Anastasia Ekkert, Booz Allen Hamilton  
Dmitry Orlov, Inbankprodukt  
Nikolay Bobrov, Special Information  
Service  
Paul Thornbury, ArmorGroup  
Sergei Bogdanov, Global Security

Sonia Kopp, Renaissance Capital  
Vadim Budaev, Raiffeisen Bank  
Valeria Shishkina, Technical Security  
Systems  
Viatcheslav Khorovsky, Lovells  
Yuri Tarasov, Delta Credit  
Vladimir Maleyev, Russian Chamber of  
Commerce and Industry  
Sergey Starikov, AmCham  
David Birney, AmCham

Anatoly Ilyin opened the meeting at 9:05 a.m., welcoming Vladimir Maleyev, Head of the National Credit Bureau, Russian Chamber of Commerce and Industry. Anatoly said that many companies have already ran into issues related to obtaining and repaying credit, and the issue was first raised in 2004 at a joint meeting of the Russian Chamber of Commerce and Industry and the American Chamber of Commerce in Russia. Vladimir Maleyev is one of the authors of the new law on credit bureaus, which comes into effect in June 1, 2005.

Vladimir Maleyev stated that the National Credit Bureau wrote the first draft law on regulation of credit bureaus, and the National Credit Bureau is the only body that holds a comprehensive set of data on the credit status of organizations operating within the Russian Federation. Vladimir noted that reports compiled by the National Credit Bureau have been created in conformance with western standards, and include data on energy companies, banks and marketing companies. The Bureau has been cooperating with many western companies with specific experience to compile credit information databases for individual industry sectors. One of the major problems faced by the National Credit Bureau is the unwillingness of credit-issuing organizations to release credit history information about their clients. Vladimir commented that creating a “black list” of debtors in poor standing is not a solution; a global system of monitoring credit transactions and payments must be established.

Vladimir remarked that although the new law on credit bureau regulation will come into force on June 1, 2005, it is unlikely to start working effectively immediately. The government has not yet defined an organ that will regulate the new law, and is focusing on defining legal procedures related to failure to provide credit information, rather than defining methodologies about how the law will actually function. Responding to a question from Yuri Tarasov, Vladimir suggested that the law may only actually begin to work effectively after a year.

Vladimir explained that currently the National Credit Bureau is gathering credit information from commercial credit-issuing organizations, but as yet there has been lack of cooperation from banks. Speaking on the process of compiling the new law, Vladimir remarked that many of the stages of development of the law have been ineffective, and many of the participators in the process have not themselves been specialists in credit bureau regulation. One of the

conclusions issue by the State Duma was that credit bureaus must obtain an operating license, which would require a credit bureau to hire the services of a company specializing in data protection. Speaking on the current law, Vladimir explained that if a borrower agrees by contract to allow credit information to be shared with a credit bureau, then the credit-issuing organization is obliged to forward such information to a credit bureau.

Vladimir said that an ideal future situation would be a system of complete transparency and disclosure, where commercial credit organizations apply no restrictions on the circulation of client credit information and there is full information sharing. Anatoly Ilyin suggested that it would be beneficial to return to the subject in six months time when experience of working under the new legislation has already been gathered.

Nikolai Bobrov commented that the unification of partner organizations was one of the original ideas behind credit bureaus, and that their creation and regulation represents a move towards globalization. He expressed the opinion that although positive credit history information may be gathered slowly, it is essential to gather positive data along with negative. He added that the priority of credit bureaus should be to establish an orderly and functional structure, rather than focusing on setting rates for the release of credit history information. Anatoly Ilyin agreed, stating that by collecting both positive and negative credit history information, banks may be more willing to cooperate with credit bureaus.

Anatoly Ilyin thanked Vladimir Maleyev for his valuable comments, and closed the meeting at 11:00 a.m.

**Next Meeting: TBA**